House of Assembly
Nova Scotia

Report

Commission of Inquiry
on
Remuneration of Elected
Provincial Officials

December 1, 1988

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY
ON
REMUNERATION OF ELECTED
PROVINCIAL OFFICIALS

George M. Mitchell, Q.C.
George L. White

HOUSE OF ASSEMBLY
P.O. BOX 1617
HALIFAX, NOVA SCOTIA
B3J 2Y3

December 1, 1988

The Honourable Arthur R. Donahoe
Speaker of the House of Assembly
Province House
Halifax, Nova Scotia

Dear Mr. Speaker:

We were appointed as Commissioners pursuant to Chapter 29 of the Statutes of Nova Scotia, 1983, to make an inquiry and a report respecting the indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid under the House of Assembly Act and the Executive Council Act.

Having completed our inquiry, in fulfillment of the commission assigned, we respectfully submit the accompanying report.

Yours sincerely,

George M. Mitchell

George L. White

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	INDEMNITIES, ALLOWANCES AND SALARIES; BACKGROUND CONSIDERATIONS	3
	1. Basic Indemnities, Allowances and Salaries for M.L.A.'s and Ministers	3
	2. Additional Payments to Members for Services in the House	4
	3. The Legislature and the Role of the M.L.A.	6
	4. Support for Legislators in Other Provinces	9
	5. Some Indicators of Recent Economic Changes in Nova Scotia	11
III.	REMUNERATION FOR M.L.A.'s	14
IV.	ADMINISTRATION AND SUPPORT, SERVICES AND FACILITIES FOR THE WORK OF PRIVATE MEMBERS AND OF CAUCUS OFFICES	18
V.	SUPPORT FOR LEADERS OF OPPOSITION PARTIES	28
VI.	SALARIES OF MEMBERS HOLDING OFFICE AND EXPENSES OF MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL	30
VII.	LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEES AND FACILITIES SUPPORTING THE HOUSE	34
VIII.	SALARIES FOR OFFICERS OF THE HOUSE	38
IX.	CONCLUSION	40
X.	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	41
XI.	SUMMARY OF PROPOSALS	43

APPENDICES

A.	Footnotes	46
B.	Letter of Appointment of Commissioners with text of s. 43A of the House of Assembly Act as amended 1983, c. 29	47

		Page
C.	Acknowledgements	49
D.	Internal Economy Board Regulations 1987	52
E.	Tables	65
F.	Principles relating to Remuneration and Support for Members and Ministers	71

INDEX TO TABLES IN THE REPORT

		Page
TABLE A	Acts Passed by the Legislature, Nova Scotia (1982-1988)	7
TABLE B	Comparison of Some Changes in Earnings, Public Sector, Nova Scotia	12
TABLE C	Summary Record of Salaries Paid to Designated Office Holders, 1985-1988	30
TABLE E-1	Summary Record of Indemnities, Allowances and Salaries for M.L.A.'s, Salaried Members and Members of the Executive Council in Nova Scotia, 1981-1988	65
TABLE E-2	Indemnities, Allowances and Salaries for Elected Members by Province 1987-1988	66
TABLE E-3	Summary of Additional Remuneration for Particular Responsibilities and for Committee Service in the Legislature by Province	67
TABLE E-4	Sitting Days per Session of the Nova Scotia Legislature 1967-1988	68
TABLE E-5	Average Salaries of Selected Public Sector Groups, Nova Scotia 1984-1988	69
TABLE E-6	Consumer Price Index for Canada (All Items) 1981-1988	70

NOTE: Requests for additional copies of this Report and those of previous Commissioners may be made to the Office of the Speaker, House of Assembly, Halifax, Nova Scotia.

I. INTRODUCTION

The House of Assembly Act by virtue of Section 43A[1] provides that the Speaker shall on or before the 1st day of October in each year appoint persons to make an inquiry and a report respecting indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid under the House of Assembly Act, the Executive Council Act and the Members' Retiring Allowances Act[2].

By way of a letter dated September 7, 1988 the Speaker appointed George M. Mitchell, Q.C. and George L. White as Commissioners to carry out the inquiry required by the House of Assembly Act and the Executive Council Act.

By way of a separate letter dated September 7, 1988, the Speaker appointed George L. White as Commissioner to inquire and report on all matters arising with respect to the Members Retiring Allowances Act.

In order to assist the Commission in its duties it has sought comment, advice and assistance from a variety of sources. All of the Members currently serving in the House of Assembly were contacted and advice was sought from some former Members. A public hearing was held after two separate advertisements in all of the daily newspapers in the Province. Notice was also mailed to the Nova Scotia Federation of Labour, the Nova Scotia Union of Municipalities, twelve Boards of Trade and the political science

departments of all Nova Scotia Universities. No party or group made representations to your Commissioners at the hearing, but one written brief was received after the hearing.

The Commissioners have met with several members of the House of Assembly and with a number of public servants associated with the work of the House and the Executive Council.

In past years the Commissioners' Report has been divided into two sections, that is, "Recommendations", of the Commission which, pursuant to the provisions of Section 43A of the House of Assembly Act, have the same force as if they were passed by the legislature, and, "Proposals", which generally deal with matters that have been raised with the Commissioners but with respect to which they have no clear mandate to decide. The Report this year will be no exception to the past and there are contained in the Report a number of Proposals for consideration of the Speaker, Government, Members and the Legislature and the Internal Economy Board.

As in other years, the Commissioners have in 1988 obtained recent information on remuneration and arrangements for support of the legislators in other provinces of Canada. This information has been obtained from the editors of an annual study, Canadian Legislatures 1987-1988[3] published by Robert J. Fleming. This is a valuable study which very easily permits the comparison of indemnities, allowances and pension arrangements prevailing in all of the legislatures of Canada.

II. INDEMNITIES, ALLOWANCES AND SALARIES: BACKGROUND CONSIDERATIONS

1. Basic Indemnities, Allowances and Salaries For M.L.A.'s and Ministers

During the calendar year 1988, a Member of the House of Assembly was entitled to an Annual Indemnity of $28,695 together with an annual expense allowance of $10,865 for a total basic remuneration of $39,560. Under the provisions of the Income Tax Act (Canada) the annual expense allowance is not considered taxable income to the Member.

In addition, during 1988 salaries were paid to certain Members in relation to the important offices they held, as follows: to the Premier $43,785; a Minister having charge of a Department (i.e., a "Minister with portfolio") $33,935; a Minister without portfolio up to $33,935; the Speaker $33,935; the Leader of the Opposition $33,935; the Deputy Speaker $16,970; and the Leader of a Recognized Party, other than the Opposition, $16,970. The recent history of basic indemnities, allowances and salaries paid to M.L.A.'s and salaried Members, since 1981 appears in Appendix E, Table E-1. A comparison of the 1987 arrangements with those prevailing in other provinces appears in Appendix E, Table E-2.

Under present provisions of s. 43A the recommendations of the Commission have the same force and effect as if enacted by the Legislature and have effect from the 1st day of January

immediately following the year in which the persons are appointed to prepare the Report. Prior to 1984, annual indemnities and allowances for Members, salaries for Officers of the House and for the Leader of a Recognized Party were all prescribed under the House of Assembly Act, while all salaries for the Premier and for the Ministers were prescribed under the Executive Council Act.

2. Additional Payments to Members for Services in the House

Some Members are assigned additional responsibilities important for the working of the House of Assembly and, consequently, they are entitled to additional remuneration for these responsibilities.

In 1988 such additional payments were as follows: House Leader ($5,000 per annum); Deputy House Leader ($3,000 per annum); House Leader of the Official Opposition ($2,000 per annum); Whip of each House ($85 per Member in the House); and Caucus Chairperson of each Party ($85 per Member in the House). These levels have not varied since 1984, or earlier in some cases. They are presently established by regulation of the Legislature Internal Economy Board.

Somewhat similar arrangements prevail in other Legislatures in Canada. Appendix E, Table E-3 is a summary of the most recent information available to this Commission, which sets forth additional payments paid to elected Members for certain responsibilities in the various Provincial Legislatures.

In the 1986 report, your Commissioners dealt extensively with the question of committee fees and their integration into the Members annual indemnity. As had been noted in earlier reports to the Speaker, there was a strong feeling that the Chairman of a number of committees should be entitled to additional payments due to the extra work load and time and commitment with which they would be involved.

In the 1988 Internal Economy Board Regulations there were provided additional payments to members and Chairmen of a number of committees.

Included in the report for 1986 was a proposal that a scale of payments to certain committee Chairmen be as follows:

Law Amendments and Legislature Internal Economy Board

- $1,500 for Chairman

Private and Local Bills, Public Accounts, Industry

- $1,000 for Chairman

All Other Committees

- $500 for Chairman

The Internal Economy Board Regulations for 1988 include the Proposals of the Commission with the addition that Chairmen of special committees and select committees be remunerated by way of a payment of $1,500. As acknowledged in earlier reports of this Commission, Members are paid a per diem fee of $100.00 plus

travel and accommodation allowances for each day a committee meets when the House is not in session or outside of the Halifax Dartmouth Metropolitan area if the House is in session.

3. **The Legislature and the Role of the M.L.A.**

The M.L.A. in the 1980's has two basic roles. First, the Member is a legislator involved in the increasingly complex tasks of government. Second, the Member is called upon to assist and serve constituents in a multitude of ways and with all kinds of problems, and the Member must respond in a timely and efficient manner.

In the primary role, as legislator, changes in technology, social values, development issues and the rapidity of change itself have made the legislative function a more demanding vocation than it was even a few years ago. Continuing interrelations of federal and provincial governments and their public policies in such a time of change place new demands on private Members, whether in government or in the opposition. The responsibilities are even greater for the Premier and for Ministers who are responsible for governing through the Legislature and for the administration of government.

The greater complexity of government is not only the result of increasing need for cooperation and coordination between levels of government but also for effective cooperation between the public and private sectors. M.L.A.'s are required to

become familiar with and deal effectively with a wide range of issues and concerns.

Appendix E, Table E-4, sets out the pattern of legislatures sitting over the past two decades.

We note that during the session of the Legislature the Members often sit on committees. As well the Legislature itself may sit for 10 to 12 hours per day if House hours are extended. In 1988 there were 19 days during which the House hours were extended. The Members must also deal with their constituency responsibilities during the evenings and on weekends. Most Members are absent from their homes and families during the Legislature session which is a sacrifice to public service experienced by the families of all elected Members.

The table below shows the number of acts passed by elected Members over the past seven years.

TABLE A

ACTS PASSED BY THE LEGISLATURE, NOVA SCOTIA[4]

	1982	1983	1984	1985	1986	1987	1988
Public	69	67	67	41	65	93	72
Total	108	100	90	72	104	127	78

In addition to their role in the House itself, Members also serve on standing, select or special committees. Members of the Executive Council and Officers of the House have continuing

responsibilities for policy and administration even when the House is not in session. Opposition Members generally have responsibility for monitoring and commenting upon particular aspects of government policy and practice, and not only when the House is in session. Members of all parties in the House also meet in caucus throughout the year. Thus, in the legislative role, every Member of the House spends considerable time throughout the year on business of the province whether or not the Assembly is in session.

The second role of the M.L.A. is to assist and serve constituents in a multitude of ways. While the constituency "case load" may vary from one constituency to another, and among Members, this general role has continued to grow. Members often now maintain several hundred active files of constituents' problems and concerns. M.L.A.'s are expected to deal with all manner of problems including many that are primarily the concern of other levels of government. No doubt the same is true for other elected members of national or local governments, for all seek to serve constituents who cannot be expected to fully understand the responsibilities of each government in our complex federal society.

Service to constituents is rendered year round. For Ministers, assistance with this service is available through the Minister's office staff. For private Members assistance with this service is provided in part through services of the caucus

office and in part by limited funds for secretarial assistance in the constituency and often by family members. For all Members from outside the Halifax-Dartmouth region service often results in a heavy "case load" of visits and calls on weekends during the period of the year when the House is in session, and regularly through the week when the House is not in session.

A recent phenomenon is that more Members are becoming, in effect, "full-time Members". They have no second vocation and depend entirely on their income as Members to support themselves and their families. In the present legislature, we estimate approximately 70% of the Members are full-time M.L.A.'s.

The level of remuneration and of support to the M.L.A. must be sufficient to allow the Member to devote the time and effort required to perform the duties expected of him or her. It should be adequate to permit persons without substantial private means to stand for election and to serve if elected and it should not result in significant financial hardship for those who serve. The principles relating to appropriate levels of remuneration and support set out in the report of an earlier Commission of Inquiry are attached in Appendix F, and we endorse these.

4. Support for Legislators in Other Provinces

The job of the M.L.A. is unlike any other trade or profession. Members must deal with an increasingly wide range of issues and concerns. The Member of the Assembly must act as

legislator, negotiator, ombudsman, social worker, public relations officer and perform several other tasks at almost any hour of the day or night, often seven days a week and nearly 365 days a year. It is a role with no job security beyond the next election, with the Member's tenure of office subject to public endorsement or rejection at the polls every three or four years.

We believe the work cannot be compared to any other job, except that of legislators elsewhere. Thus, there is merit in comparing the role and remuneration of Nova Scotia M.L.A.'s to elected Members in similar roles in other provinces. Appendix E, Table E-2, sets out latest information on the basic indemnity and expense allowance of M.L.A.'s in the ten provinces as well as the salaries of certain Members, and Table E-3 is a summary of additional payments for service in the provincial legislatures[5].

So far as we can judge measures of workload, such as sitting days, bills passed, size of constituency, number of constituents and committees of the House, it would appear that Nova Scotia Members have a workload comparable to other M.L.A.'s in most provinces in Canada, with the exception of Ontario and Quebec.

In 1987 the basic statutory remuneration of the Nova Scotia M.L.A., that is, the indemnity and general expense allowance, was slightly less than the average for provincial legislators in Canada but still less than the indemnities and

allowances (without considering additional payments) paid to Members in New Brunswick, Quebec, Ontario, British Columbia and Newfoundland. Although a survey of remuneration for all provincial members in Canada has not been published for 1988, given the general record of remuneration in other provinces over the past few years we believe that the 1988 basic statutory remuneration of the Nova Scotia M.L.A. has fallen somewhat as compared to other provincial legislators. In 1987, for example, the remuneration of Newfoundland Members surpassed that of Members in Nova Scotia for the first time.

5. Some Indicators of Recent Economic Changes in N.S.

Since the M.L.A.'s role cannot be compared directly with that of any other profession, trade or employment, direct comparisons of remuneration with other groups are inappropriate.

Yet the trend of changes in remuneration for others in the province may be useful in considering possible change for M.L.A.'s. In a number of our provinces and in the federal Parliament statutory provision is made for automatic annual change in remuneration for Members by formulae related to changes in provincial wages and salaries, or in public service salaries generally or in price or other indexes.

Some indicators of recent economic changes in Nova Scotia appear in Appendix E, Tables E-5 and E-6.

The following table summarizes comparative increases in rates of earnings of certain public sector groups from 1987 to 1988.

TABLE B

Comparison of Some Changes in Earnings, Public Sector, Nova Scotia

	1987 - 1988
Member's Integrated Anual Indemnity	3%
Allowance	3%
Minister's Salaries	3%
Public Sector Salaries:	
Civil Service Management Group	3.41%
Deputy Ministers	3.41%
Provincial Judges	3.41%
Teachers	4.06%
Nurses	3.41%

Another factor for comparison is the rate of inflation. As measured by changes in the Consumer Price Index for Canada, the inflation rate continued through 1988 at a level significantly below that prevailing in the early 1980's. As Appendix E, Table E-6 indicates, the cumulative increase from December 1981 to September 1988 was approximately 72.2%. We note that over the same period this compares with increases in the indemnity and allowance for M.L.A.'s of 69.1% and an increase in salaries of Ministers of approximately 35.7% for the same

period. The annual increase in CPI for Canada for the latest month reported, September 1988, was 4.11% and for Halifax it was 4.0%.

In light of the various background considerations dealt with in this section of this report, we turn now to discussion of arrangements that we recommend should be made for indemnities, allowances and salaries for Members and for Ministers for 1989, and to some proposals that we believe warrant consideration. The recent history of basic indemnities, allowances and salaries paid to M.L.A.'s and salaried Members since 1981 appears in Appendix E, Table E-1.

III. REMUNERATION FOR M.L.A.'S

As we indicated in earlier reports, we believe that it is extremely important that information relating to the salaries and indemnities, allowances, committee fees and other financial information relating to the Members of the Legislative Assembly should be freely available to the general public. This is necessary to totally eliminate any perception in the eyes of the general public that Members of the Legislative Assembly are receiving income about which the general public is not aware.

We are pleased that Members of opposition parties have been included on the Internal Economy Board as, apart from the report of your Commissioners, this body is an important regulator of the fees and expenses of Members of the Legislative Assembly. All of the regulations and actions of this committee are now in the public domain.

It has been interesting to your Commissioners that during their inquiries carried out over the past several months, comparatively few Members of the Legislative Assembly submitted a proposal for any significant increase in remuneration. While it is true that there are some Members of the House of Assembly who do receive remuneration from outside occupations or professions, it appears (as noted earlier in this report) that many Members are becoming full-time Members without any other source of income.

Notwithstanding that the Assembly only meets for approximately four months during the spring of the year, the Legislative Committees are meeting more frequently when the House is not in session. We expect this situation to increase.

Furthermore, all Members of the Assembly are required to spend a significant amount of time above and beyond what might be considered the normal working hours to provide assistance, information and help to their constituents.

It is also relevant that the publication, "Canadian Legislatures", indicates that the provinces in which Members receive more indemnity and expense allowance are the Provinces of New Brunswick, Quebec, Ontario, British Columbia and Newfoundland. A Nova Scotia legislator receives greater income than his counterpart in Manitoba, Alberta, Saskatchewan and Prince Edward Island. The differences are not great, but the comparison confirms that the incomes of Nova Scotia legislators are quite reasonable.

Considerable restraint has been exercised over legislator's salaries during the past three years. The increases have been: 1986 - 2%, 1987 - 2%, and 1988 - 3%. We have concluded that it is unfair for our M.L.A.'s to fall too far behind the increases in the cost of living, and we think an increase for 1989 of 4.0% would be fair and reasonable.

The Income Tax Act of Canada provides that Members of a Legislative Assembly may receive an allowance for expenses of up

to 50% of their annual indemnity. In Nova Scotia, this percentage has dropped in recent years. In British Columbia, Saskatchewan, Manitoba, New Brunswick and Newfoundland, the M.L.A.s all are paid in accordance with the Income Tax Act. We believe that in 1989 the increase in income to a Member should be applied only to his or her allowance.

We would therefore recommend:

R-1 For the year 1989 a Member of the House of Assembly be paid an annual indemnity of $28,695 and an annual allowance for expenses of $12,450.

These would compare with the indemnity for 1988 of $28,695 and the annual allowance for expenses in 1987 of $10,865.

During the course of our enquiry, we have received several suggestions relating to the severance provisions of s. 40A of the House of Assembly Act. The purpose of this provision is to ease the return to private life of a Member who either resigns or is defeated after an election.

In last year's report, we made changes which caused the inclusion in the severance allowance of the Member's allowance as well as his or her indemnity. This change, together with the payment over twelve installments, provides some help for a Member returning to normal life. While the severance allowance can provide some adjustment in the return to private life, it is not expected this allowance would serve as a complete replacement for a Member's lost income.

However, one change to the provisions relating to severance seems appropriate. At the present time, severance is only paid if a Member is a sitting member when the House of Assembly dissolves, whether or not the Member reoffers in the ensuing election. Your Commissioners believe that it would be fair that a Member receive a severance allowance in the event that he or she decided to resign as a Member before a dissolution of the House of Assembly.

Therefore, we recommend:

R-2 In addition to a Member being entitled to a severance allowance in accordance with Section 40(A)(1) as amended by the Report dated December 1, 1987, a person who is a Member of the House who resigns as a Member of the House shall be entitled to be paid a severance allowance in accordance with the provisions of Section 40(A)(1) as amended by the provisions of the Report of the Commission of Inquiry dated December 1, 1987.

IV. ADMINISTRATION AND SUPPORT, SERVICES AND FACILITIES FOR THE WORK OF PRIVATE MEMBERS AND OF CAUCUS OFFICES PURSUANT TO REGULATION

The House of Assembly Act, s. 43, authorizes the Legislature Internal Economy Board to make regulations which provide support to Members for work in both their constituencies and Halifax. The regulations for 1988 are annexed hereto as Appendix "D". Administration for the payments to Members presently falls under the jurisdiction of the Board and is handled on a daily basis by the administrative staff of the Speaker's office.

The Commissioners have concluded that these funding provisions do not clearly fall within the meaning of "indemnities, allowances and salaries" about which we might make recommendations that would have to be implemented.

However during this inquiry our attention was drawn to several matters to which we shall refer without recommendation. As in past years we shall deal with these items by way of proposal which, we trust, will be considered by the Legislature Internal Economy Board in drafting any changes to their Regulations for 1989.

The measure of support which is currently provided to all Members of the House of Assembly are summarized hereunder

although they are dealt with in more detail in Appendix "D". For purposes of expenses, Members are divided into two groups, that is, inside Members and outside Members. An outside Member is defined in the House of Assembly Act as a Member who is ordinarily resident within the meaning of the Elections Act, more than 25 miles distant from the place where the House of Assembly ordinarily sits.

The levels of support in 1988 were as follows:

(a) $2,000 for travel in a member's constituency;

(b) $300 monthly for constituency expenses without receipts;

(c) $650 monthly for constituency expenses with receipts for an inside Member;

(d) $900 monthly for constituency expenses with receipts for an outside Member;

(e) $3,000 for postage;

(f) 52 trips per constituency to the City of Halifax.

As the result of the submission from a considerable number of Members, it has become evident that most of the Members of the Legislature now maintain a constituency office in their constituency, and a few Members with large constituencies either have or are considering the possibility of two offices to serve their constituents. Costs of operating these offices are increasing, secretaries must be hired, telephones installed, and space rented.

Indeed, the allowances for travel and postage have not been changed since 1986 although in the meantime, for example, postal rates have increased by about 15%. Clearly, the cost of travel in constituencies has increased by an equal or greater amount.

After having given the matter considerable thought and having reviewed the levels of support provided in other provinces, we propose the following changes in support for Members:

P-1

(a) The sum of $2,200.00 per annum in lieu of travel expenses within a Member's constituency for each inside Member;

(b) The sum of $3,200.00 per annum in lieu of travel expenses within a Member's constituency for each outside Member;

(c) The sum of $300.00 monthly for constituency expenses payable without receipts. This sum is cumulative, if not claimed for any particular month, and is payable to all Members;

(d) The sum of $1,600.00 each month for constituency expenses including office space, secretarial assistance, telephone, etc., which must be supported by proper receipts and which may be claimed by each Member;

(e) The sum of $3,5000.00 per annum for expenses incurred on account of postage;

(f) During the calendar year each Member is entitled to be reimbursed for 52 trips between the place where he is ordinarily resident and the City of Halifax to attend sittings of the House and other business relating to his or her constituency.

As part of the monthly operating expense of a constituency office, there includes rental charges for equipment and, in some cases, furniture. Over time the government will have fully paid for this furniture through the medium of a Member's constituency allowance. There still remains some confusion amongst the Members with respect to the ownership of this property in the event that a Member is defeated in an election or resigns from his position as a Member. It is the view of the Commission that the policy must be determined by the Internal Economy Board, but it is our view that this equipment should revert to the Province of Nova Scotia. This would also appear to be the view of the majority of Members. If it were otherwise, the perception in the mind of the public might be that Members were obtaining a further benefit over and above their allowances and indemnities.

We propose that:

P-2 The Legislature Economy Board consider and if deemed appropriate establish a policy respecting the cost of equipment and furniture for constituency offices which assures that a Member does not receive or appear to receive a personal financial benefit arising from the reimbursement of constituency expenses.

For each of the 52 trips that a Member makes to the City of Halifax, he or she is entitled to recover his or her accommodation expenses up to $75.00 per day. This applies for attendance at committee meetings, attending the sittings of the House, and when he or she visits Halifax on each of his or her 52 permitted annual visits. We are advised that many major Halifax hotels offer a special rate to Members less than $75.00 per day.

Several of the outside Members rent apartments to provide accommodation for themselves and find that apart from the time when the House is sitting, they cannot recover the costs of their accommodation. While this does provide a cost saving to the Government, it is unfair to those Members.

We propose that:

> P-3 The Legislature Internal Economy Board prescribe rules providing for appropriate reimbursement for those Members who wish to use rental accommodations in place of hotel rooms, in an amont sufficient to recover accommodation expense up to but not exceeding the accommodations expense which they could normally charge for hotel accommodations in Halifax pursuant to the Regulations of the Internal Economy Board.

This would be much more fair and would not cost the government more than it has already committed itself to spend on this item of Members' expense.

With respect to the Caucus Offices of each Party, support in past years has been based upon a formula worked out by the Internal Economy Board. This has consisted of payment calculated by multiplying the number of Members of the caucus by

a base amount. In order to provide adequate support for those parties that had a small number of Members, a specific minimum amount was provided for.

Since the election held in 1988, the size of the respective caucuses has altered. There are now 28 Members of the Government Caucus, 21 Members of the Official Opposition Caucus, 2 Members of the New Democratic Party, and 1 Independent Member.

In 1988, the Internal Economy Board provided for payments to each caucus the following:

(a) To the Government Caucus, $29,600.00 each month;

(b) To the Official Opposition Caucus, $13,300.00 each month;

(c) To the Caucus of the New Democratic Party, the sum of $4,700.00 each month.

We have entertained submissions from representatives of the Caucuses and the Leaders of the three political parties and we have also received a submission from the independent Member, all relating to the provision of appropriate caucus staffing.

The Government Caucus is currently serviced by both full-time and casual employees constituting a staff of 11 persons. The staff includes a Director of Research, Office Manager, Researcher, Media Clerk, and seven secretaries.

The Caucus Office provides services to all Members of the Government although to a somewhat lesser extent to Cabinet Ministers who have the assistance of a departmental staff to deal with matters of government interest.

The Caucus of the Official Opposition is served at the present time by a staff of three secretaries and a recently approved position of Office Manager. The Caucus of the Official Opposition has some limited access to the research facilities provided to the Leader of the Official Opposition pursuant to the provisions of the House of Assembly Act. These include a Director of Research, Executive Assistant, Researcher and Senior Secretary.

With respect to the Caucus of the New Democratic Party, it is the general impression of the Commission that the existing level of funding provides to that Caucus adequate staffing for all of its activities in a way which is generally consistent with the number of Members of that Party in the Legislature.

Based on our review of these matters and submissions made to us, we propose with respect to the further staffing of the Caucus Offices the following:

> P-4 That the Legislature Internal Economy Board consider and if deemed appropriate provide additional research assistance to each of the Government Caucus and the Caucus of the Official Opposition by increasing the research staff for the Government Caucus with the addition of one person and by increasing the research staff of the Caucus of the Official Opposition by four persons.
>
> That the Legislature Internal Economy Board consider and if deemed appropriate provide additional secretarial services to the Caucus of the Official Opposition by the provision of full-time secretaries so that the secretarial staff shall be not less than seven and, in addition, to provide the services of an Office Receptionist.

That the Legislature Internal Economy Board consider increases in funding for all Party Caucus Offices, if appropriate, to take into consideration the increases in the cost of living.

With respect to the provision of support services for the Independent Member after due consideration, we are of the opinion that he should be provided with caucus space in the City of Halifax consisting of the following:

(a) Office space in the government owned Dennis Building;

(b) One secretary, Civil Service Classification AS(6);

(c) Necessary furniture, one telephone line, one typewriter and reasonable postage.

Should any question arise with respect to the above services, such question shall be resolved by the Internal Economy Board.

A further matter has been raised by a number of the Members of each caucus. At the present time, the party caucus meetings are ordinarily held in the City of Halifax and each Member of caucus attending is entitled to claim such meeting as one of his or her 52 trips from his or her constituency to the City of Halifax. Thus, the costs of caucus meetings are in effect borne by the Government. Should a political party wish to hold a caucus meeting outside the City of Halifax all of the expense must be borne by the individual Members or by the political party. It has been suggested to your Commission that

caucus meetings should be permitted to be held in other parts of the Province and that the costs of such meetings should be borne by the Government in the same way as if such meeting had been held in the City of Halifax.

This suggestion has considerable merit in that it gives the opportunity for the various caucuses to become more visible in other parts of the Province and could contribute to a greater liaison between Members of caucus and the general public. The holding of such meeting outside the City of Halifax might also result in savings to Government if such caucus meetings are considered as being one of a Member's 52 trips to and from Halifax.

We would therefore propose:

> P-5 That the Legislature Internal Economy Board permit the caucuses of the parties holding official status to meet at a location outside of the City of Halifax up to four times a year, provided, however, that for each Member attending such a caucus meeting, the attendance would be considered to be one of his or her 52 trips to and from his or her constituency to the City of Halifax, and that he or she be compensated upon the same terms as are provided for by the rules of the Internal Economy Board for such trips.

We have received a representation from the representative of the Legislative Library. Concern has been expressed that in the event the political parties increase their use of the library research facilities that the present staff of the library will be unable to provide such service expeditiously to the Members. There is little doubt that the Legislative Library is

extremely well run on a very limited budget and is probably one of the most attractive legislative libraries in all of Canada.

We believe it is appropriate for the Internal Economy Board to closely review the situation of the Library and its staff, keeping in mind that it may be appropriate to increase the staff by one new librarian.

V. SUPPORT FOR LEADERS OF OPPOSITION PARTIES

The House of Assembly Act provides that the Leader of the Official Opposition is to have the benefit of office facilities, equipment, secretaries, a director of research, research assistants and senior assistant. The Legislature Internal Economy Board, by regulation, provides for reimbursement of travel and related expenses of the Leader of the Official Opposition. The regulations further allow that if the Leader of the Official Opposition is an outside Member, he is to receive an allowance equivalent to that provided to a Minister for living expenses within the City of Halifax. Additionally, the Leader of the Official Opposition is entitled to a leased motor vehicle on the same basis as a Minister.

The House of Assembly Act specifies that the Leader of a recognized party is to be provided with office facilities, a secretary, a research assistant, and a senior assistant. The regulations of the Board also make provision for reimbursement of travel and related expenses of the Leader of a recognized party. Such a "Leader of a recognized party" is defined in s. 43B as "the Leader in the House of any party represented by two or more Members other than the Premier or the Leader of the Opposition whose party was a "recognized party" in accordance with the Elections Act and had candidates standing for election for three

quarters of the seats of Members in the House and whose party received ten percent or more of the votes officially recorded in the latest general election of Members of the House".

While there is little doubt that the Leaders of the Opposition Parties would like a greater level of financial support, they are generally satisfied with what is a much superior situation for Leaders of Opposition parties than has been the experience a number of years ago.

In last year's Report, your Commissioners proposed that the Leader of the Opposition and one assistant be provided with travel assistance on two occasions outside the Province of Nova Scotia. Your Commissioners would expect that that sort of assistance would continue to be provided into the future.

VI. SALARIES OF MEMBERS HOLDING OFFICE AND EXPENSES OF MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL

This section of the report pertains to remuneration and expenses for those who hold office pursuant to the Executive Council Act and to remuneration for those who hold office in the House of Assembly.

The Premier and Ministers of the Crown (including those without portfolio) are paid a salary for their offices in accordance with the Executive Council Act. The House of Assembly Act provides an annual salary for the Speaker, Deputy Speaker, Leader of the Opposition and the leader of a recognized party (other than the Premier or Leader of the Opposition). The recent history of salaries for these offices is traced in the reports of earlier Inquiries of this nature. The summary record of salaries paid for these offices in recent years appears in Table C below.

TABLE C

SUMMARY RECORD OF SALARIES PAID TO DESIGNATED OFFICE HOLDERS 1985 - 1988

	1985	1986	1987	1988
Premier	$40,860	$41,675	$42,510	$43,785
Minister with Department	31,670	32,300	32,950	33,935
Minister without Portfolio	Up to 31,670	Up to 32,300	Up to 32,950	Up to 33,935

Speaker	31,670	32,300	32,950	33,935
Deputy Speaker	15,835	16,150	16,475	16,970
Leader of the Opposition	31,670	32,300	32,950	33,935
Leader of Recognized Party	15,835	16,150	16,475	16,970

We recommend that salaries for the several officers be increased by no more than four percent (4%) and be established as follows:

R-3 For 1989 the salary of the Premier, under the Executive Council Act, be $45,535.

R-4 For 1989 the salary of a Minister having charge of a Department, under the Executive Council Act, be $35,290.

R-5 For 1989 the maximum possible salary for a Minister without portfolio, under the Executive Council Act, be $35,290.

R-6 For 1989 the salary of the Speaker, under the House of Assembly Act, be $35,290.

R-7 For 1989 the salary of the Deputy Speaker, under the House of Assembly Act, be $17,650.

R-8 For 1989 the salary for the Leader of the Opposition, under the House of Assembly Act, be $35,290 and for the Leader of a recognized party, under the House of Assembly Act, be $17,650.

For other salaried Members for whom salaries or payment for offices are provided under regulation, we recommend:

R-9 For 1989 the salary established by regulation of the Legislature Internal Economy Board for the House Leader, for the Deputy House Leader, for the House Leader of the Official Opposition, for the Whip of each Party and for the Caucus Chairperson of each Party, in each case, be the same as in 1987.

In accordance with s. 6 of the Executive Council Act, all Members of the Executive Council are entitled to payment to indemnify them for reasonable expenses incurred for travelling or otherwise in the discharge of official duties. The Premier has been entitled to a representation allowance of $4,000 for several years to cover additional miscellaneous expenses that the person holding the office of the First Minister in the province incurs in the discharge of his duties. This should be continued.

All those members of the Executive Council who are outside Members as defined in the House of Assembly Act, are entitled to an amount to reimburse them for travelling expenses between Halifax and the constituency and for actual expenses incurred as a result of being in Halifax while a member of the Council. One of the more important allowances provided for Ministers who are "outside Members" is an allowance for rental of accommodations in Halifax, in recognition of the fact that in most cases their service to the Province requires them to have a second residence. In 1988 up to $12,000 could be recovered for costs incurred for accommodation in Halifax by these Ministers.

As was stated in the 1985 Report, there are two major benefit programmes provided for the public service which have been made available to Members.

Thus the medical plan for the public service has been made available to Members on the same basis as for public servants and so has the basic group life programme. In the

latter, however, we understand that the optional coverage that may be arranged by a Member at his expense does not now provide for insurance coverage of more than the annual indemnity. It ought to provide for coverage of the total remuneration of a Member including the annual allowance for expenses.

During the course of our review this year representations again were made to us in connection with the lack of a long-term disability programme for Members of the Legislative Assembly. We noted this in last year's Report and we are advised that the Government is taking steps to institute a long-term disability programme that will cover the Members of the Legislature.

VII. LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEES AND FACILITIES SUPPORTING THE HOUSE

Committees of the House of Assembly fall into three categories. The two principal groups of committees are the Standing Committees supplemented by Select Committees and the Committee of the Whole House.

In 1988 the Standing Committees were Law Amendments, Private and Local Bills, Public Accounts, Economic Development, Internal Affairs, Human Resources, Resources, Community Services, and Veterans's Affairs. Prior to dissolution of the House for the General Election of 1988, there was a Special Committee on Rules and Procedures and there were three Select Committees dealing with Tourism, Trade Negotiations and Forestry. We assume that with the new House, similar such committees or more will be struck.

It was noted in a written submission to your Commission by a well-known political scientist and commentator that the committee system has become the basis of a well-functioning parliamentary government. This is inevitable as the task of government becomes more complex and specialized. In order to deal with matters coming before the Legislature, competently and in a timely manner, the committees become more imporant.

In recognizing this development, the government has converted a large portion of the Dennis Building into first-class

facilities for the holding of meetings of committees. One of the difficulties of the existing committee system as perceived by the Commissioners is that while the support staff provided for the use of the facilities is competent and diligent, its numbers may become insufficient to handle all the demands placed upon them. For example, the Public Accounts Committee is an extremely important committee and its work over a period of time may be of considerable benefit to the public interest. It may well be necessary for this committee to have associated with it a full or part-time organizer or research person.

In 1987, the first year that the committee facilities were in full operation, there were approximately 104 committee meetings. This includes meetings of the Law Amendments and Private and Local Bill Committees which ordinarily meet in Province House.

It is to be expected that the work of the committee meetings will expand into the future, and it is quite possible that, as has happened in other Legislative Assemblies across Canada, it may be necessary to consider the appointment of a full-time clerk of the Legislature who would, as well as fulfill his duties as clerk, administer all of the work of the Committees' Office.

In our Report last year this Commission proposed that the Internal Economy Board review the support staff needs of the committee office administration, and give consideration to providing further support staff where needed.

We still believe that further attention should be directed to the provision of appropriate support staff for the important committees, such as the Public Accounts Committee. It is to be noted that the full resources of the Office of the Legislative Counsel is provided to the Law Amendments Committee and the Private and Local Bills Committees. Elsewhere in this report, we have proposed increased research assistance to be provided to the Government and Official Opposition Caucuses which presumably could be of some indirect benefit to the committee system.

As the committee support facilities have evolved, so has the role of the other key support facilities to the House. The duties and responsibilities of the Speaker's Office have increased significantly in recent years so this office is now responsible for administration of not only the House but many independent government commissions, task forces, agencies and bodies. With the growing complexity of statutory law, the role of the Legislative Counsel has become more burdensome and challenging than ever before. Likewise the evolution of the role of the private Member, Legislative Committees and the Caucus Offices has placed increasing demands on the Legislative Library. It appears appropriate that the role of these facilities be reviewed in light of current requirements.

We propose that:

P-6 The Legislature Internal Economy Board consider and if deemed appropriate cause a review to be made of all of the matters relating to the organization and administration of support facilities to the House of Assembly, including the role, responsibility and resources of the Clerk's Office, Speaker's Office, Legislative Counsel, Legislative Library, Legislative Committee Office and other similar support facilities.

VIII. SALARIES FOR OFFICERS OF THE HOUSE

The House of Assembly Act, in Part VII, designates four Officers of the House of Assembly. These officers are the Chief Clerk, Assistant Clerk, Legislative Counsel and Sergeant-at-Arms. The Chief Clerk, Assistant Clerk and Legislative Counsel are designated by the Act as appointees of the Governor in Council and under the Public Service Act the Sergeant-at-Arms is appointed by the House.

The salaries for all of these officers are presently prescribed by regulation of the Legislature Internal Economy Board. In the case of the Legislative Counsel, historically the salary for this officer was fixed by Governor in Council. Following the Report of the Inquiry Commission of 1983, an Order in Council was passed enabling the salary of this officer to be set by the Legislature Internal Economy Board.

With regard to the other officers, subsection 43(3) of the House of Assembly Act provides these salaries to be set by regulation of the Board and the regulation provides that for 1988 the salary of the Chief Clerk is $37,000, for the Assistant Clerk is $31,200, and for the Sergeant-at-Arms is $20,750.

One of the difficulties faced by your Commissioners is that the Chief Clerk, Assistant Clerk, and Sergeant at Arms are part-time employees of the Legislature while the Legislative

Counsel is a full-time employee with the status of a Deputy Minister in the government. We are also cognizant of the fact that the Legislative Counsel is called upon by government and the Legislature in a way which results in him working many overtime hours each year. His devoted and able service to the Legislature and government is of the highest level.

As a result and in line with our general recommendations for salary increments, the Commissioners propose that:

> P-7 The salaries of the Chief Clerk, the Assistant Clerk, Sergeant-at-Arms be reviewed by the Legislature Internal Economy Board and set for 1989 at a level of four percent above that established for 1988.
>
> P-8 With respect to the salary of the Legislative Counsel the Legislature Internal Economy Board consider the current remuneration of the Legislative Counsel and set such remuneration for 1989.

We also note that the House of Assembly Act, s. 51A provides for the reimbursement to the officers of the House as may be authorized by the Speaker or other Member of the Legislature Internal Economy Board for reasonable expenses of travel accommodation or otherwise incurred while absent from their ordinary place of residence in connection with the business of the house or as a representative of the House or of the Province whether the House is in session or not.

IX. CONCLUSION

In the course of our Inquiry a variety of matters were brought to the attention of the Commissioners; not all of these have been dealt with or recorded in this Report. We do record our gratitude to the many who assisted us by oral or written submissions or by giving Commissioners the benefit of considered opinions on matters relevant to this Inquiry.

After increases of 2 percent for 1986 and 1987, and 3% in 1988, we have recommended a 4 percent increase for 1989. We also believe that the severance allowance and the soon to be in place Members' long-term disability will be helpful to Members of the Legislature and will provide them with the kind of benefits that already exist in many of the public and private employment sectors.

We continue to believe that it is good policy to make public all aspects that touch upon the indemnity and allowances of Members of the Legislature.

X. SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

The Commissioners make the following recommendations in their Report, after inquiry, respecting the indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid under the House of Assembly Act and the Executive Council Act:

R-1 For the year 1989, a Member of the House of Assembly be paid an annual indemnity of $28,695 and an annual allowance for expenses of $12,450. (p. 16)

R-2 In addition to a Member being entitled to a severance allowance in accordance with Section 40(A)(1) as amended by the Report dated December 1, 1987, a person who is a Member of the House who resigns as a Member of the House shall be entitled to be paid a severance allowance in accordance with the provisions of Section 40(A)(1) as amended by the provisions of the Report of the Commission of Inquiry dated December 1, 1987. (p.17)

R-3 For 1989 the salary of the Premier, under the Executive Council Act, be $45,535. (p. 31)

R-4 For 1989 the salary of a Minister having charge of a Department under the Executive Council Act, be $35,290. (p. 31)

R-5 For 1989 the maximum possible salary for a Minister without Portfolio, under the Executive Council Act, be $35,290. (p. 31)

R-6 For 1989 the salary of the Speaker, under the House of Assembly Act, be $35,290. (p. 31)

R-7 For 1989 the salary of the Deputy Speaker, under the House of Assembly Act, be $17,650. (p. 31)

R-8 For 1989 the salary of the Leader of the Opposition, under the House of Assembly Act, be $35,290, and for the Leader of a recognized party, under the House of Assembly Act, be $17,650. (p. 31)

R-9 For 1989 the salary established by regulation of the Legislature Internal Economy Board for the House Leader, for the Deputy House Leader, for the House Leader of the Official Opposition, for the Whip of each Party, and for the Caucus Chairperson of each Party, in each case, be the same as in 1988. (p. 31)

XI. SUMMARY OF PROPOSALS

The Commissioners consider that a number of matters which do not clearly fall within their commission "to make an enquiry and a report respecting the indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid..." are worthy of further consideration by those responsible for the operations of the House of Assembly. While these are not recommendations to be implemented by the Speaker, the Commissioners, after inquiry, make these proposals:

P-1

(a) The sum of $2,200.00 per annum in lieu of travel expenses within a Member's constituency for each inside Member;

(b) The sum of $3,200.00 per annum in lieu of travel expenses within a Member's constituency for each outside Member;

(c) The sum of $300.00 monthly for constituency expenses payable without receipts. This sum is cumulative, if not claimed for any particular month, and is payable to all Members;

(d) The sum of $1,600.00 each month for constituency expenses including office space, secretarial assistance, telephone, etc., which must be supported by proper receipts and which may be claimed by each Member;

(e) The sum of $3,5000.00 per annum for expenses incurred on account of postage;

(f) During the calendar year each Member is entitled to be reimbursed for 52 trips between the place where he is ordinarily resident and the City of Halifax to attend sittings of the House and other business relating to his or her constituency. (p. 20)

P-2 The Legislature Economy Board consider and if deemed appropriate establish a policy respecting the cost of equipment and furniture for constituency offices which assures that a Member does not receive or appear to receive a personal financial benefit arising from the reimbursement of constituency expenses. (p. 21)

P-3 The Legislature Internal Economy Board prescribe rules providing for appropriate reimbursement for those Members who wish to use rental accommodations in place of hotel rooms, in an amont sufficient to recover accommodation expense up to but not exceeding the accommodations expense which they could normally charge for hotel accommodations in Halifax pursuant to the Regulations of the Internal Economy Board. (p. 22)

P-4 That the Legislature Internal Economy Board consider and if deemed appropriate provide additional research assistance to each of the Government Caucus and the Caucus of the Official Opposition by increasing the research staff for the Government Caucus with the addition of one person and by increasing the research staff of the Caucus of the Official Opposition by four persons.

That the Legislature Internal Economy Board consider and if deemed appropriate provide additional secretarial services to the Caucus of the Official Opposition by the provision of full-time secretaries so that the secretarial staff shall be not less than seven and, in addition, to provide the services of an Office Receptionist. (p. 24)

P-5 That the Legislature Internal Economy Board permit the caucuses of the parties holding official status to meet at a location outside of the City of Halifax up to four times a year, provided, however, that for each Member attending such a caucus meeting, the attendance would be considered to be one of his or her 52 trips to and from his or her constituency to the City of Halifax, and that he or she be compensated upon the same terms as are provided for by the rules of the Internal Economy Board for such trips. (p. 26)

P-6 The Legislature Internal Economy Board consider and if deemed appropriate cause a review to be made of all of the matters relating to the organization and administration of support facilities to the House of Assembly, including the role, responsibility and resources of the Clerk's Office, Speaker's Office, Legislative Counsel, Legislative Library, Legislative Committee Office and other similar support facilities. (p. 37)

P-7 The salaries of the Chief Clerk, the Assistant Clerk, Sergeant-at-Arms be reviewed by the Legislature Internal Economy Board and set for 1989 at a level of four percent above that established for 1988. (p. 39)

P-8 With respect to the salary of the Legislative Counsel the Legislature Internal Economy Board consider the current remuneration of the Legislative Counsel and set such remuneration for 1989. (p. 39)

APPENDIX "A"
FOOTNOTES

1. House of Assembly Act, R.S.N.S. 1967, c. 128, s. 43A(3)(4) as amended 1983, c. 29. (For text of s. 43A see Appendix "B").

2. See Appendix "B" for letter appointing Commission, with a copy of s. 43A of the House of Assembly Act, as enacted 1983, c. 29.

3. Canadian Legislatures: 1987-1988, General Editor, Robert J. Fleming.

4. Information provided by the Office of the Speaker.

5. Information provided by the Canadian Legislatures: 1987-1988, General Editor, Robert J. Fleming.

APPENDIX "B"

The Speaker

House of Assembly
Nova Scotia

PO Box 1617
Halifax, Nova Scotia
B3J 2Y3

902 424-5707

September 7, 1988

Mr. George White, LL.B.
Patterson Kitz
Barristers and Solicitors
P. O. Box 1068
Truro, Nova Scotia
B2N 5B9

and

Mr. George Mitchell, Q.C.
Cox, Downie & Goodfellow
Barristers and Solicitors
P. O. Box 2380, Station M
Halifax, Nova Scotia
B3J 3E5

Gentlemen:

This will confirm your appointment as Commissioners pursuant to Chapter 29 of the Statutes of Nova Scotia, 1983, to make an enquiry and a report respecting the indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid under the House of Assembly Act and the Executive Council Act.

I thank you for your willingness to undertake these duties and can assure you of the full co-operation of the Office of the Speaker in carrying out your work.

I look forward to receiving your report on or before December 1, 1988 as required by the Act.

Yours very truly,

Arthur R. Donahoe
Speaker

ARD:nk

APPENDIX "B" - Cont'd

AN ACT TO AMEND CHAPTER 128 OF THE REVISED STATUTES, 1967, THE HOUSE OF ASSEMBLY ACT

(Assented to the 1st day of June, A.D. 1983)

Be it enacted by the Governor and Assembly as follows:

1 Section 43A of Chapter 128 of the Revised Statutes, 1967, the House of Assembly Act, is repealed and the following Section substituted therefor:

43A (1) The Speaker, after appropriate consultation, shall on or before the first day of October in each year appoint persons to make an inquiry and a report respecting the indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid under this Act, the Executive Council Act and the Members' Retiring Allowances Act.

(2) The persons appointed pursuant to subsection (1) shall have all the powers and privileges and immunities of a commissioner under the Public Inquiries Act and shall complete their inquiry and deliver their report containing recommendations to the Speaker on or before the first day of December in the year in which they are appointed.

(3) The Speaker, upon receipt of the report containing the recommendations of the persons appointed pursuant to subsection (1), shall cause the recommendations to be implemented and they shall have the same force and effect as if enacted by the Legislature and shall be in substitution for provisions of this Act, the Executive Council Act and the Members' Retiring Allowances Act, as the case may be.

(4) The recommendations shall apply, from the first day of January immediately following the year in which the persons are appointed to make the report, until subsequently changed.

APPENDIX "C"

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Commissioners gratefully acknowledge the contributions of those many individuals and organizations who made submissions to them or were helpful when consulted in the course of this Inquiry.

During the course of the Inquiry, advertisements, on two separate occasions, were placed in all the daily newspapers in Nova Scotia to advise the general public of the Commission's work and to invite submissions. Written notice was sent to the Nova Scotia Federation of Labour, Nova Scotia Union of Municipalities, twelve of the Boards of Trade in the Province, and all of the Political Science Departments of our Universities.

A public hearing was held in Halifax on Wednesday, October 26, 1988. This year one Brief was filed with the Commission subsequent to the hearing.

However, the Commissioners also met with or exchanged correspondence with a considerable number of people. We acknowledge the very helpful assistance of the following persons:

Prof. Agar Adamson,
Acadia University

Jim Barkhouse, M.L.A., Lunenburg East

Mr. Bernie Boudreau, M.L.A.
Cape Breton The Lakes

Mr. Ross Bragg, M.L.A.
Cumberland West

Guy Brown, M.L.A., Cumberland Centre

Hon. John M. Buchanan, Q.C., Premier, M.L.A., Halifax Atlantic

Joseph Casey, M.L.A., Digby

O. Paul Cormier, Auditor General, Nova Scotia

Hon. Arthur Donahoe, Q.C., Speaker of the House, M.L.A., Halifax Citadel

Walter Fitzgerald, former M.L.A.

Percy Fleet, Superintendent of Pensions, Department of Finance

J. William Gillis, M.L.A., Antigonish

Don Hubley, Administrative Coordinator, Office of the Speaker

Ms. Sandy Jolly, M.L.A.
Dartmouth North

Hon. J. Greg Kerr, Minister of Finance, M.L.A., Annapolis West

Dr. Chuck MacNeil, M.L.A., Guysborough

Hon. John James Leefe, Minister of Fisheries, M.L.A. Queens

Edward Lorraine, M.L.A.,
Colchester North

Ken MacAskill, M.L.A., Victoria

Paul MacEwan, M.L.A., Cape Breton Nova

Hon. Vincent J. MacLean, M.L.A., Cape Breton South, Leader of the Official Opposition

Dan MacNeil, M.L.A., Guysborough

Alexa McDonough, M.L.A., Halifax Chebucto, Leader of New Democratic Party

Richard Mann, M.L.A., Richmond

Hon. Joel Matheson, Minister of Health, M.L.A., Halifax Bedford Basin

Hon. George Moody, Chairman of the Management Board, M.L.A., Kings West

Margaret Murray, Provincial Librarian

Jerry O'Malley, M.L.A., Halifax Needham

S. Myles Rector, Director of Administration, Office of the Speaker

Ross Sheppard, Civil Service Commission

Dr. Jim Smith, M.L.A., Dartmouth East

Gordon Sturdy, Director, Public Service Pensions

James H. Vaughan, former M.L.A.

Graham Walker, Q.C., Legislative Counsel

The Commissioners wish to draw attention to a publication that was most helpful in their inquiry: Canadian Legislatures: 1987-1988 edited by Robert J. Fleming. This study presents a comprehensive overview of the workings of the House of Commons and the legislatures of the ten provinces and two territories.

The Commissioners acknowledge the assistance in their work of S. Myles Rector, Don Hubley, and Ms. Joan Kelly, all of the Office of the Speaker, who assisted with correspondence and advertising for the Inquiry. Ms. Kelly served as Secretary to the Commission of Inquiry and assisted with many details which made the preparation of this Report far simpler than it would have been without the benefit of her knowledge and experience.

APPENDIX "D"

LEGISLATURE INTERNAL ECONOMY BOARD REGULATION

CITATION

1 This Regulation may be cited as Internal Economy Board Regulation 1988.

AUTHORITY

2 This Regulation is made by the Legislature Internal Economy Board, pursuant to Section 43 of the House of Assembly Act, Chapter 128 of the Revised Statutes, 1967, as that Section is enacted by Chapter 39 of the Acts of 1974 and amended by Chapter 22 of the Acts of 1978-79 and Chapter 28 of the Acts of 1982, subsection (2) of Section 40 of the House of Assembly Act, as that subsection is enacted by said Chapter 39 and amended by said Chapters 22 and 28, subsection (1) of Section 40B of the House of Assembly Act, as that subsection is enacted by said Chapter 22 and amended by said Chapter 28, subsection (7) of Section 42 of the House of Assembly Act, as that subsection is enacted by said Chapter 39 and amended by said Chapter 22, and Section 6A of the Executive Council Act, as that Section is enacted by Chapter 24 of the Acts of 1982.

INTERPRETATION

3 Unless otherwise stated, in this Regulation,

(a) "economy air fare" does not include expenses incurred for the private charter of aeroplanes;

(b) "recognized party" means a party represented by two or more members and which is a recognized party in accordance with the Elections Act and had candidates standing for election for three quarters of the seats of members in the House and which received ten per cent or more of the votes officially recorded in the latest general election of the members of the House; and

(c) other words, phrases and expressions have the same meaning as in the House of Assembly Act.

HOUSE INDEMNITY-ALLOWANCE-TRAVEL-EXPENSE

Indemnity-Allowance-Salary

4 (1) Each member of the House is entitled during the year 1988 to receive a member's indemnity and allowance in four equal instalments, or where the member so requests in writing of the Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board, in twelve or twenty-six equal instalments, each instalment being paid at equally spaced intervals throughout the year.

(2) The Clerk, the Assistant Clerk and the Sergeant-at-Arms are eligible to draw their salaries in the same manner as the members of the House of Assembly.

Franking

5 Each member of the House is entitled to receive $3,000.00 in substitution for the franking privilege and in lieu of expenses incurred on account of postage.

Outside Member Travel

6 Subject to Section 35, each outside member, except the member of the Executive Council holding the recognized position of Premier or a member of the Executive Council having charge of a department or the member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Opposition or a leader of a recognized party, is entitled to reimbursement for actual travelling expenses calculated in accordance with Section 36 and incurred in 1988 between the place where the outside member is ordinarily resident and the City of Halifax to attend sittings of the House.

Outside Member Allowance

7 Each outside member, except the member of the Executive Council holding the recognized position of Premier or a member of the Executive Council having charge of a department or the member occupying the recognized position of leader of the Opposition or a leader of a recognized party, is entitled for attending a sitting of the House to

(a) an amount of $50.00 on account of expenses, without receipts, for each day that the outside member is in attendance at the House while the House is in session; and

(b) reimbursement in addition to that authorized by clause (a) for expenses,

(i) with proper receipts for sleeping accommodation charges only, or

(ii) notwithstanding Sections 6 and 35, for travel by the shortest and most convenient route between the place where the outside member is ordinarily resident and the place where the House ordinarily sits at the rate set out in Section 36,

incurred in attending the House while it is in session to a maximum of $75.00 per day.

Non-Outside Member and Outside Member of Executive Council Allowance

8 Each non-outside member, and each outside member who is a member of the Executive Council or the member occupying the recognized position of

Leader of the Opposition or a leader of a recognized party and not entitled to submit a claim pursuant to Section 7, is entitled to an amount of $35.00, without receipts, for expenses for each day that the member is in attendance at the House while the House is in session.

Committee Fee

9 (1) The Chairman and each member of each Standing, Select and Special Committee of the House and the Legislature Internal Economy Board is entitled to receive a payment of $100.00 for each day on which the member attends a meeting of a Committee or the Board when the House is not sitting or the meeting is held outside the Halifax-Dartmouth metropolitan area.

(2) Notwithstanding subsection (1), no member shall receive more than one payment pursuant to subsection (1) for a day for attending more than one meeting of a Standing, Select or Special Committee of the House or the Legislature Internal Economy Board on the same day at the same place or, in the case of the Halifax-Dartmouth metropolitan area, in the Halifax-Dartmouth metropolitan area.

Committee Chairmen

10 The Chairman of each Standing Committee, each Select Committee and each Special Committee of the House is entitled to payment as follows:

(a) Law Amendments Committee - $1,500.00;

(b) Private and Local Bills Committee, Industry Committee and Public Accounts Committee - $1,000.00;

(c) all other Standing Committees of the House - $500.00;

(d) each Special Committee and each Select Committee - $1,500.00.

Committee Expenses

11 (1) For attendance at a meeting referred to in Section 9, the Chairman or member is entitled to receive reimbursement for

(a) actual expenses incurred in respect of accommodation, meals and other reasonable expenses incurred for the purpose of attending the meeting; and

(b) travelling expenses calculated in accordance with Section 36.

(2) Sleeping accommodation charges incurred and claimed pursuant to subsection (1) shall

(a) be accompanied by proper receipts; and

(b) not exceed the government rate for the establishment where the member stayed.

House Leaders

12 (1) A payment of $5,000.00 shall be made to the House Leader.

(2) A payment of $3,000.00 shall be made to the Deputy House Leader.

(3) A payment of $2,000.00 shall be made to the person recognized by the Speaker as occupying the position of House Leader of the Official Opposition.

(4) The Whip of each recognized party of the House shall receive a payment determined by multiplying the number of members of the party by $85.00.

(5) The Caucus Chairman of each recognized party of the House shall receive a payment determined by multiplying the number of members of the party by $85.00.

(6) In this Section, "member" means a duly elected member of the House but does not include the Speaker.

(7) If a payment is made pursuant to this Section to a member in the capacity of House Leader, Deputy House Leader, House Leader of the Official Opposition, Whip or Caucus Chairman, no further payment may be made pursuant to this Section in respect of that position.

CAUCUS

13 (1) In order to promote the intent of the House of Assembly Act with respect to support services for Caucus Offices, during the period from the first day of April, 1988, to the thirty-first day of March, 1989, a sum shall be paid to the Caucus Offices as follows:

(a) Government Caucus Office - an amount not exceeding $29,600.00 each month;

(b) Official Opposition Caucus Office - an amount not exceeding $13,300,00 each month;

(c) Caucus of the remaining recognized party, namely, the New Democratic Party - an amount not exceeding $4,700.00 each month.

(2) Payment pursuant to this Section shall be made to each Caucus Office only and not to an individual member of the House.

Caucus Chairmen

14 (1) The Chairman of the Government Caucus may engage the services of a secretary at the AS 11 level on the Government Administrative Support Classification and Pay Plan out of the money provided for the Government Caucus Office pursuant to Section 13.

(2) The chairman of the Caucus of the Official Opposition may engage the services of a secretary at the AS 11 level on the Government Administrative Support Classification and Pay Plan out of the money provided for the Official Opposition Caucus Office pursuant to Section 13.

Caucus Chairmen - Expenses

15 Where the Chairman of a Caucus is an outside member, that member is entitled to claim and to be paid, in addition to any other expenses allowed the Chairman, the same allowance and reimbursement authorized for an outside member for twelve return trips between the place where the Chairman is ordinarily resident and the City of Halifax.

PREMIER

Representation Allowance

16 A representation allowance in the amount of $4,000.00 shall be paid to the Premier of Nova Scotia for the period from January 1, 1988, to December 31, 1988.

LEADER OF OPPOSITION

Expenses with the Province

17 The member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Official Opposition, in carrying out official duties within the Province, is entitled to be reimbursed for actual and reasonable expenses incurred for accommodation, meals, travel and incidentals incurred by the Leader and one assistant.

Special Travel

18 In addition to the entitlement authorized by Section 31, the Leader of the Official Opposition is entitled to be reimbursed for actual and reasonable expenses incurred for accommodation, meals, travel and incidentals incurred by the Leader and one assistant in carrying out official duties outside the Province on two separate occasions during the period from January 1, 1988, to December 31, 1988, subject to the restriction that on each occasion reimbursement shall not exceed expenses incurred for travel that includes more than three mights accommodation.

Living Allowance

19 The member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Official Opposition, as an outside member, shall receive an allowance equivalent

to that provided pursuant to the Executive Council Act to members of the Executive Council for living expenses within the City of Halifax.

Motor Vehicle

20 The member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Official Opposition is entitled to a leased motor vehicle on the same basis as is a member of the Executive Council for a government leased or purchased motor vehicle.

LEADER OF RECOGNIZED PARTY

Expenses within the Province

21 A leader of a recognized party in carrying out official duties within the Province is entitled to be reimbursed for actual and reasonable expenses for accommodation, meals, travel and incidentals incurred by the leader and one assistant.

22 In addition to the entitlement authorized by Section 31, the Leader of the Official Opposition is entitled to be reimbursed for actual and reasonable expenses incurred for accommodation, meals, travel and incidentals incurred by the Leader in carrying out official duties outside the Province on two separate occasions during the period from January 1, 1988, to December 31, 1988, subject to the restriction that on each occasion reimbursement shall not exceed expenses incurred for travel that includes more than three nights accommodation.

MEMBER FOR CAPE BRETON NOVA

Support Services

23 (1) For the period from January 1, 1988, to the day immediately following the tenth sitting day where the House stands adjourned for a period of ten sitting days or more, the member for Cape Breton Nova shall be provided at the City of Halifax with

(a) office space not exceeding three hundred square feet;

(b) one secretary at the Civil Service classification AS(6);

(c) office furniture necessary to furnish the office for the member and one secretary;

(d) one telephone line;

(e) one typewriter; and

(f) reasonable postage.

(2) From the time immediately following the tenth sitting day where the House stands adjourned for a period of ten sitting days or more until

December 31, 1988, the member for Cape Breton Nova shall be provided at the City of Halifax with

(a) office space not exceeding three hundred square feet;

(b) one secretary at the Civil Service classification AS(6) provided however that a maximum expenditure for secretarial remuneration does not exceed fifty percent of the remuneration normally payable for that period to a secretary in the AS(6) classification;

(c) office furniture necessary to furnish the office for the member and one secretary;

(d) one telephone line;

(e) one typewriter; and

(f) reasonable postabe.

(3) Should there be any question arising from subsection (1) or subsection (2) in respect of the office of the member for Cape Breton Nova concerning

(a) the selection of space;

(b) the level of the secretary within the AS(6) classification;

(c) the selection or amount of furniture;

(d) the selection of a typewriter; or

(e) reasonable postabe,

such question shall be determined by the Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board.

(4) The member for Cape Breton Nova may incur long distance telephone charges for telephone calls made from the office telephone in respect of House or constituency business.

MEMBER FOR INVERNESS SOUTH

Support Services

24 (1) The member for Inverness South shall be provided at the City of Halifax with

(a) office space not exceeding three hundred square feet;

(b) one secretary at the Civil Service classification AS(6), provided however that the maximum expenditure for secretarial

remuneration does not exceed fifty per cent of the remuneration payable for the period from the first day of January, 1988, to the thirty-first day of December, 1988, to a secretary within the AS(6) classification;

(c) office furniture necessary to furnish the office for the member and one secretary;

(d) one telephone line;

(e) one typewriter; and

(f) reasonable postage.

(2) Should there be any question arising from subsection (1) in respect of the office of the member for Inverness South concerning

(a) the selection of space;

(b) the level of the secretary within the AS(6) classification;

(c) the selection or amount of furniture;

(d) the selection of a typewriter; or

(e) reasonable postabe,

such question shall be determined by the Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board.

(3) The member for Inverness South may incur long distance telephone charges for telephone calls made from the office telephone in respect of House or constituency business.

CHIEF CLERK

Salary

25 The Chief Clerk shall be paid a salary of $37,000.00 per annum.

ASSISTANT CLERK

Salary

26 The Assistant Clerk shall be paid a salary of $31,200.00 per annum.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS

Salary

27 The Sergeant-at-Arms shall be paid a salary of $20,750.00 per annum.

CONSTITUENCY MATTERS

Travel

28 Each member of the House is entitled to receive $2,000.00 in lieu of expenses incurred on account of travel within the member's constituency.

Services

29 (1) Each member of the House who is not an outside member is entitled to receive the sum of $300.00 per month in lieu of expenses incurred on account of services to that member's constituency and a further sum not exceeding $650.00 per month for expenses accounted for by proper receipt and incurred in services in that member's constituency for the provision of office space, meeting places, equipment, telephone, telephone answering services, advertising and secretarial services.

(2) Each member of the House who is an outside member is entitled to receive the sum of $300.00 per month in lieu of expenses incurred on account of services to that member's constituency and a further sum not exceeding $900.00 per month for expenses accounted for by proper receipt and incurred in services in that member's constituency for the provision of office space, meeting places, equipment, telephone, telephone answering services, advertising and secretarial services.

(3) Where the maximum amount that may be claimed pursuant to subsection (1) or subsection (2) is not claimed in any month the unclaimed balance may be claimed in a subsequent month.

(4) Expenses incurred for the purchase of office furniture and equipment are not expenses for which a member may be reimbursed pursuant to this Section.

(5) Expenses incurred for the lease or the lease-purchase of office furniture and equipment are expenses for which a member may be reimbursed pursuant to this Section.

Attendance at Halifax

30 (1) Subject to Section 35, each outside member, except the member of the Executive Council holding the recognized position of Premier or a member of the Executive Council having charge of a department or the member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Opposition or a leader of a recognized party, is entitled to

(a) an allowance of $50.00 on account of expenses, without receipts, for each day; and

(b) reimbursement in addition to that authorized by clause (a) for travelling expenses calculated in accordance with Section 36 and expenses for sleeping accommodation charges incurred,

for return trips between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and the City of Halifax to attend in Halifax other than to attend a sitting of the

House or one of its committees.

(2) Sleeping accommodation charges incurred and claimed for pursuant to subsection (1) shall

(a) be accompanied by proper receipts;

(b) not be for more than two nights accommodation unless approved in advance by the Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board; and

(c) not exceed the government rate for the establishment where the member stayed.

Attendance at Ottawa

31 (1) Each member is entitled to

(a) an allowance of $75.00 on account of expenses, without receipts, for each day; and

(b) reimbursement in addition to that authorized by clause (a) for economy air fare, normal airline ground transportation and expenses for sleeping accommodation charges incurred,

for two return trips between the place where he is ordinarily resident and the City of Ottawa to attend in Ottawa on constituency business.

(2) Sleeping accommodation charges incurred and claimed pursuant to subsection (1) shall

(a) be accompanied by proper receipts;

(b) not be for more than two nights accommodation; and

(c) not exceed the government rate for the establishment where the member stayed.

Other Attendance Outside the Province

32 (1) Where a member is not reimbursed pursuant to Section 31, that member is entitled to

(a) an allowance of $75.00 on account of expenses, without receipts, for each day; and

(b) reimbursement, in addition to that authorized by clause (a), for economy air fare, normal airline ground transportation and expenses for sleeping accommodation charges incurred,

for one return trip between the place where he is ordinarily resident and another place in Canada outside the Province to attend that other place on constituency

business.

(2) Sleeping accommodation charges incurred and claimed pursuant to subsection (1) shall

(a) be accompanied by proper receipts;

(b) not be for more than two nights accommodation; and

(c) not exceed the government rate for the establishment where the member stayed.

(3) Notwithstanding subsections (1) and (2), the member is not entitled to an amount pursuant to this Section for economy air fare charges in excess of that to which the member would have been entitled pursuant to Section 31.

Expenses of Critics

33 Persons occupying the position of critic of a Department of agency of Government are entitled to reimbursement for actual and reasonable expenses for accommodation, meals, travel and incidentals incurred by the critic for attending meetings necessarily incidental to the duties of the critic if prior approval of the Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board is obtained prior to the incurring of the expenses.

Legislature Internal Economy Board

34 (1) The Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board is entitled to a payment of $1,500.00.

(2) The Chairman and each member of the Legislature Internal Economy Board is entitled to expenses for meetings of the Legislature Internal Economy Board on the same basis and in the same manner as a member of a committee reimbursed pursuant to Section 11.

GENERAL

Restriction

35 No member shall be reimbursed for travel expenses authorized by Sections 6 and 30 in excess of fifty-two return trips in 1987 between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and the City of Halifax to attend in Halifax, other than for attendance at a meeting of a Select Committee, a Special Committee or a Standing Committee.

Calculation of Travel Expense

36 Each outside member of the House, the member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Opposition and a leader of a recognized party entitled under the House of Assembly Act to receive travelling expenses is

entitled to be reimbursed for claimed travelling expenses incurred out of the Consolidated Fund of the Province for travel by the shortest and most convenient route between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and the place where the House ordinarily sits or the Committee is meeting at

(a) the rate of 42 cents per mile or 26.2 cents per kilometre; or

(b) the cost of economy air fare plus normal airline ground transportation.

Request for Reimbursement

37 A person who makes a request for payment or reimbursement shall

(a) make the request in writing on the form provided by the Legislature Internal Economy Board;

(b) make the request within six months from the time the payment or claim for which reimbursement is made was incurred or became eligible to be paid;

(c) sign the request and certify that the request is correct; and

(d) forward the request to the office of the Speaker.

Limitation on Reimbursement

38 Notwithstanding anything contained in this Regulation, no member may claim for reimbursement an expense

(a) for which the member is reimbursed pursuant to another regulation or enactment;

(b) paid to the member's spouse, child, parent, brother or sister;

(c) paid to a person living in the same dwelling, as a member of the same household;

(d) paid to any business or on account of property in which the member or those persons mentioned in clause (b) or (c) have an ownership interest.

Payment Approval

39 (1) Directions for payment of indemnities, allowances, payments or reimbursements and approval of requests for payment or reimbursement shall be issued or made by the Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board, the Vice-Chairman or a person designated by the Chairman.

(2) The person who approves a request for payment or reimbursement has the authority to reduce or increase the amount of the

payment or reimbursement claimed where that person determines that the amount claimed is in error.

Application

40 Unless otherwise stated in a specific Section, all Sections of this Regulation apply from the first day of January, 1988, to the thirty-first day of December, 1988.

Approved by the Legislature Internal Economy Board at Halifax, Nova Scotia this 15th day of December, 1987.

Hon. Arthur R. Donahoe, Q.C.
Chairman

APPENDIX "E"
TABLE E-1

TABLE II

SUMMARY OF INDEMNITIES, ALLOWANCES AND SALARIES FOR
M.L.A.'s SALARIED MEMBERS AND MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL IN NOVA SCOTIA

1981 - 1988

YEAR	Annual Indemnity	Annual Expense Allowance	Speaker	Deputy Speaker	Leader of Opposition	Leader of Recognized Party	Minister without Portfolio	Minister with Portfolio	Premier
1981	$15,600	$ 7,800	$15,000	$ 7,500	$25,000	$10,000	$ 7,500 - 25,000	$25,000	$32,000
1982	$16,400	$ 8,200	$15,000	$ 7,500	$25,000	$10,000	$ 7,500 - 25,000	$25,000	$32,000
1983	$18,656*	$ 9,328	$29,150	$14,575	$29,150	$14,575	$ 7,500 - 29,150	$29,150	$37,630
1984	$19,400*	$ 9,700	$30,300	$15,150	$30,300	$15,150	$ 7,500 - 30,300	$30,300	$39,511
1985	$20,280*	$10,140	$31,670	$15,835	$31,670	$15,835	$ 7,500 - 31,670	$31,670	$40,860
1986	$27,315	$10,340	$32,300	$16,150	$32,300	$16,150	$ 7,500 - 32,300	$32,300	$41,675
1987	$27,860	$10,550	$32,950	$16,475	$32,950	$16,475	$ 7,500 - 32,950	$32,950	$42,510
1988	$28,695	$10,865	$33,935	$16,970	$33,935	$16,970	$ 7,500 - 33,935	$33,935	$43,785

* For the years 1983, 1984 and 1985, Committee fees earned on average for each member for service on Committees were $8,300, $8,500, and $6,600 respectively. The "integrated annual indemnity" as referred to in the December 1, 1985 Report of the Commission of Inquiry was $26,956 for 1983, $27,900 for 1984 and $26,780 for 1985.

TABLE III

INDEMNITIES, ALLOWANCES AND SALARIES FOR ELECTED MEMBERS
BY PROVINCE 1967-68

(From: Canadian Legislatures - 1967 - 1968
Edited by Robert J. Flemming)

	N.S.	N.B.	P.E.I.	NFLD.	QUE.	ONT.	MAN.	SASK.	ALTA.	B.C.
Year	1967	1967	1967	1967	1968	1967	1967	1964	1968	1966
Basic Indemnity	$27,860	$31,498	$18,000	$26,543	$57,788	$39,299	$25,014	$20,968	$29,548	$27,500
Expense Allowance	10,500	12,599	9,000	13,271	9,180	13,171	12,507	10,484	7,883	13,750
Salaries:										
Premier	42,510	43,046	43,000	46,742	55,427	48,376	26,600	37,656	50,157	45,000
Minister with Portfolio	32,950	28,699	33,000	33,888	39,591	28,743	20,600	28,327	40,841	39,000
Minister without Portfolio	7,500 to	21,524	N/A	N/A	34,312	14,433	15,600	28,327	28,972	25,000
Opposition Leader	32,950	28,699	33,000	33,888	39,591	33,684	20,600	28,327	40,841	30,000
Leader of Recognized Party	16,475	N/A	N/A	N/A	18,476	16,902	N/A	14,163	7,243	N/A
Speaker	32,950	21,524	9,400	33,888	39,591	21,217	15,500	11,054	40,841	30,000
Deputy Speaker	16,475	19,762	4,800	16,865	18,476	8,880	3,500	6,562	20,420	15,000

Newfoundland Members also receive a travel allowance of $1,060 to $5,300 depending on distance to St. John's.

NOTE: For the 1968 levels in Nova Scotia, see Table E-1.

SUMMARY OF ADDITIONAL REMUNERATION FOR PARTICULAR RESPONSIBILITIES AND FOR COMMITTEE SERVICE IN THE LEGISLATURE BY PROVINCE

A. Particular Legislature Responsibilities (1987)

Responsibility	N.S.	N.B.	P.E.I.	NFLD.	QUE.	ONT.	MAN.	SASK.	ALTA.	B.C.
Parliamentary Assistant	-	-	-	$13,250	$10,558	$ 8,880	$2,500	$6,907	-	$6,000
Deputy Chair, C'tee of Whole	-	-	-	5,300	-	6,168	2,500	1,923	10,210	3,000
Standing C'tee, Chair	$500-$1500	-	-	5,000	13,197	4,810	- sess.	1,923/	-	-
Standing C'tee Vice Chair	-	-	-	4,000	10,588	-	-	-	-	-
House Leader	5,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Deputy Gov't House Leader	3,000	-	-	-	10,588	-	-	-	-	-
Opposition House Leader	2,000	-	-	16,298	18,476	10,979	2,500 sess.	1,923/	-	6,000
Deputy Opposition House Leader	-	-	-	-	7,918	-	-	-	-	-
3rd Party House Leader	-	-	-	-	-	8,264	-	-	-	-
Chief Gov't Whip	$85/mem.	1,500	-	5,135	18,476	10,979	2,500	3,206	-	6,000
Asst. Gov't Whip	-	-	-	-	7,918	7,524	- sess.	1,923/	-	3,000
Chief Opposition Whip	$85/mem.	1,500	-	5,135	15,836	7,524	2,500 sess.	3,206/	-	6,000
Asst. Opposition Whip	-	-	-	-	7,918	5,427	- sess.	1,923/	-	-
Chief 3rd Party Whip	$85/mem.	-	-	-	2,918	6,168	- sess.	1,035/	-	-
Asst. 3rd Party Whip	-	-	-	-	-	4,934	- sess.	517/	-	-
Caucus Chairperson, each Party	$85/mem.	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

B. Remuneration for Committee Service (1987)

In addition to payments for Standing Committee Chairman and Vice-Chairman, noted above, the following summary reflects arrangements reported for service as Members on House Committees:

- per diem - Saskatchewan
- per diem paid when House not sitting in Newfoundland, P.E.I., Nova Scotia, Quebec, Manitoba and Alberta, and in Ontario similar payments when House not sitting or Committees meet away from legislature while the House is sitting.
- per diem expense allowance, non-accountable, paid in New Brunswick.
- established by Order in Council for specific committees in British Columbia - Members usually receive no per diem for committee work.

Source: Canadian Legislatures 1987-1988 General - Editor Robert J. Fleming.

APPENDIX "E"

TABLE E-4

SITTING DAYS PER SESSION OF THE NOVA SCOTIA LEGISLATURE 1967 - 1988

Year	Assembly	Session	Sitting Days
1967	49th Assembly	1st Session	4 days
1968		2nd Session	33 days
1969		3rd Session	47 days
1970		4th Session	45 days
1970-71	50th Assembly	1st Session	40 days
		2nd Session	6 days
1972		3rd Session	57 days
1973		4th Session	52 days
		5th Session	11 days
1974	51st Assembly	1st Session	41 days
1975-76		2nd Session	69 days
1976-77		3rd Session	55 days
1977-78		4th Session	58 days
1978		5th Session	54 days
1978-79	52nd Assembly	1st Session	77 days
1980		2nd Session	64 days
1981		3rd Session	83 days
1982	53rd Assembly	1st Session	87 days
1983		2nd Session	64 days
1984		3rd Session	67 days
1985	54th Assembly	1st Session	50 days
1986		2nd Session	56 days
1987		3rd Session	59 days
1988		4th Session	56 days

TOTAL DAYS OF EXTENDED HOURS 1981 - 1988

1981	38 days
1982	31 days
1983	33 days
1984	22 days
1985	16 days
1986	32 days
1987	22 days
1988	19 days

Source: The Office of the Speaker of the House of Assembly.

APPENDIX "E"

TABLE E-5

AVERAGE SALARIES OF SELECTED PUBLIC SECTOR GROUPS

NOVA SCOTIA, 1984 - 1988

	Year	Average Salary
DEPUTY MINISTERS	April 1, 1984	$70,681.
	April 1, 1985	$73,492.
	March 30, 1986	$74,456.
	March 29, 1987	$77,027.
	March 27, 1988	$80,002
PROVINCIAL JUDGES	April 1, 1984	$57,000.
	April 1, 1985	$60,000.
	April 1, 1986	$61,200.
	April 1, 1987	$63,036.
	April 1, 1988	$68,000
CIVIL SERVICE MANAGEMENT GROUP	April 1, 1984	$39,311.
	April 1, 1985	$41,309.
	March 30, 1986	$42,136.
	March 29, 1987	$42,820.
	April 20, 1988	$43,297
TEACHERS**	August 1, 1984	$35,307.
	August 1, 1985	$38,131.
	August 1, 1986	$38,064.
	August 1, 1987	$40,390.
	August 1, 1988	$41,977
NURSES	April 1, 1984	$26,878.
	March 31, 1985	$29,130.
	March 30, 1986	$29,548.
	March 29, 1987	$29,614.
	April 20, 1988	$29,420

** This average includes all vocational and technical school teachers and also all supervisory allowances for principals and supervisors.

Source: Nova Scotia Civil Service Commission, November, 1988

APPENDIX "E"
TABLE E-6

CONSUMER PRICE INDEX FOR CANADA (ALL ITEMS)
1981 - 1988

(1981 = 100)

December	1981	104.7
December	1982	114.4
December	1983	119.6
December	1984	124.1
September	1985	128.0
September	1986	133.3
September	1987	139.3
September	1988	145.0

Cumulative Increase: December 1981 to September, 1988

40.3 index points or 72.2%

Increase September 1987 to September 1988, All Items Index:

for Canada as a whole	5.7 points or 4.1%
for Halifax	5.5 points or 4.0%

Source: Statistics Canada, Consumer Prices and Price Indexes

APPENDIX "F"

Principles Relating to Remuneration and Support for Members and Ministers

Identified in Previous Reports of Commissions of Inquiry in Nova Scotia in 1977 and 1982

The primary rewards in an active life of service to the public are the opportunity to serve and contribute to the resolution of social problems and to the improvement of life for all in the province. In our meetings and discussions with elected members, and former members, we have been impressed with this vision by those who so serve, and by the sincerity with which they approach their task. As in an earlier report, we again underline our considered view that over the years Nova Scotia has been singularly blessed by the willingness of able people to take their part in public life. Many have done so at considerable personal sacrifice for themselves and their families. In recent years, as at other times when remuneration for service in office has fallen behind escalating costs, many have served at substantial financial cost to themselves both in direct costs exceeding their remuneration, sometimes to the extent of several thousands of dollars, and indirect losses of income that might be derived from business, professional practice or other activities if time were not so committed to service in government, the legislature and to constituents.

At any time the financial and other circumstances of life for members elected to the legislature will vary on a personal, individual basis. Fortunately, our legislators do not fit any mold and they represent constituencies which vary in size, in economic circumstances and in social standards. From a variety of backgrounds across the province they together provide assurance that our democratic processes ultimately will work to serve our own long-run interests.

While there is no "standard" M.L.A., we have the task of assessing standards for their remuneration. In our view, that task involves developing a standard for fair and reasonable indemnities, allowances and salaries based on certain principles. Those principles enunciated in previous reports include:

1) remuneration should be adequate in light of the time and responsibilities involved in office, and the risks of disruption of career and personal opportunities so that our political parties and their leaders, upon whom parliamentary government depends, may attract the most able persons among us to seek office and not deter the best of those elected from accepting and continuing full-time service in government;

2) remuneration should be reasonable so that the person who has no personal financial resources except through his vocational earnings, which may be terminated or seriously affected if he is elected, is not dissuaded from seeking office to serve the province merely because of financial circumstances;

3) remuneration should be adequate to ensure that M.L.A.'s and Ministers are supported without unfair financial sacrifice upon them or their families, particularly for those in their prime earning years when family and other obligations are likely to be heavy.

Remuneration and support that is fair and reasonable will not unduly encourage anyone interested primarily in financial reward for the balanced judgment of political parties and of the electorate can be counted upon to reject those not primarily interested in public service. Nor will such remuneration result in any significant financial advantage for any elected member who happens to be comparatively well-to-do, for our progressive income tax structure precludes that result.

APPENDIX "F" - Cont'd

In the application of these principles a number of factors have been taken into account in previous studies including:

1) The evolving workload of M.L.A.'s, the House of Assembly and Ministers both in relation to legislative and governmental concerns of the province, and, for each member in service to constituents.

2) Changes in general economic circumstances since the last basic change in indemnities, allowances and salaries – e.g.

   - changes in inflation indexes.
   - changes in wages and salaries in the private and public sectors in the province.

3) Comparisons with levels of similar payments for service in the legislatures of other provinces of Canada.

House of Assembly
Nova Scotia

Report

Commission of Inquiry
on
Remuneration of Elected
Provincial Officials

December 1, 1988

(Members' Retiring Allowances Act)

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY
ON
REMUNERATION OF ELECTED
PROVINCIAL OFFICIALS

George M. Mitchell, Q.C.
George L. White

HOUSE OF ASSEMBLY
P.O. BOX 1617
HALIFAX, NOVA SCOTIA
B3J 2Y3

December 1, 1988

The Honourable Arthur R. Donahoe
Speaker of the House of Assembly
Province House
Halifax, Nova Scotia

Dear Mr. Speaker:

I was appointed as a Commissioner pursuant to Chapter 29 of the Statutes of Nova Scotia, 1983, to make an inquiry and a report respecting the allowances to be paid under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act.

Having completed the inquiry, in fulfilment of the commission assigned, the undersigned respectfully submits the accompanying report.

Yours sincerely,

George L. White
Commissioner

NOVA SCOTIA

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

ON

REMUNERATION OF ELECTED

PROVINCIAL OFFICIALS

(MEMBERS' RETIRING ALLOWANCES ACT)

REPORT

1 DECEMBER 1988

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	RETIRING ALLOWANCES IN NOVA SCOTIA	3
III.	COMPARISON WITH OTHER JURISDICTIONS	6
IV.	MATTERS REVIEWED	9
V.	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	16
VI.	SUMMARY OF PROPOSALS	17

APPENDICES

		Page
A.	Footnotes	18
B.	Letter of Appointment of Commission	19

I. INTRODUCTION

In accordance with Section 43A of the House of Assembly Act, the Speaker of the House appointed a Commission by letter dated September 7, 1988, "to make an inquiry and a report respecting the allowances to be paid under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act,"[1] (hereinafter referred to as "the Act").

In the course of the inquiry, the Commission followed the same procedure as outlined in the introduction of the foregoing Report of the Commission of Inquiry respecting the House of Assembly Act and the Executive Council Act. In addition, some former Members of the Legislature have recently formed an Association of Former Members for the purposes of representing their views and making representations on their behalf on such matters as retiring allowances. Representatives of the Association, namely, Mr. James H. Vaughan and Mr. Walter R. Fitzgerald, met with the Commission for the purpose of reviewing concerns of the Association.

The publication Canadian Legislatures[2] has provided a unique comparison of retiring provisions in the Canadian jurisdictions.

The Superintendent of Pensions for the Province of Nova Scotia, namely Mr. Percy Fleet and the Director of Public Services Pensions, Department of Finance, Mr. Gordon Sturdy, have been of great assistance to the Commission. Also, although my fellow Commissioner with regard to the Inquiry under the House of Assembly Act and the Executive Council Act, Mr. George M. Mitchell, Q.C., has been unable to join in the recommendations of this Report respecting the Members' Retiring Allowances Act, I wish to acknowledge my debt to Mr. Mitchell

whose previous experience in the Legislature and in the Ministry was immensely helpful in the conduct of the inquiry and in consideration of the matters at issue.

As a Commission appointed by Mr. Speaker, I am authorized under the House of Assembly Act to make "an inquiry and a report respecting allowances to be paid under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act". Accordingly, any Recommendations contained in this Report would be made with the expectation they will be acted upon effective January 1, 1988, pursuant to Section 43A of the House of Assembly Act. Suggestions identified as Proposals pertain to matters raised with the Commissioner but for which the Commissioner has no clear mandate to decide.

II. RETIRING ALLOWANCES IN NOVA SCOTIA

The Members' Retiring Allowances Act establishes a pension account for Members of the Legislative Assembly. Members contribute and Government makes an equal contribution and credits interest on the balance in the account from time to time. If at any time the account is insufficient to make payment provided under the Act, the account is then to be credited with sufficient funds for this purpose from the Consolidated Fund of the Province.

The following summary describes the arrangements that now prevail for existing Members. It should be noted that not all of the arrangements outlined would apply to the service by existing Members for the years prior to 1982.

Eligibility for an allowance - a Member must contribute to the account and must have served in two General Assemblies for five years or more, must have attained age 55 and ceased to be a Member, or ceased to be a Member and be totally disabled, or must have died in which case an allowance is payable to a surviving spouse and dependent children. By regulation a person otherwise qualified for an allowance but who has not reached the age of 55 years may elect to take an actuarially reduced pension at an earlier age than 55 years.

Contribution by a Member - A Member contributes at the rate of 8% of the indemnity and annual allowance for expenses paid to him, and salaried Members and Ministers contribute 8% of the salary paid to them for their office.

Years of Contribution and Benefits - The maximum years of contribution to the plan are 15 years and for Members benefits accumulate, for each year of contribution and service, at the rate of 5% of the average annual indemnity and expense allowance during the last three years of service. The maximum benefit cannot exceed 75% of the average annual indemnity and expense allowance during the last three years of service. Salaried Members and Ministers are entitled to additional allowances accumulating at the same rate (5%) of the average salary payment for the three highest years of salaried service (or if salaried service is less than three years, then the average is that of the actual years served).

Benefits and the Impact of Inflation - By regulation under the Members Retiring

Allowances Act, allowances paid have been increased in recent years by applying the same indexing factor as has been applied to pensions payable under the Public Service Superannuation Act. Thus former Members or their dependents paid an allowance have the benefit of these arrangements to offset, in part at least, the impact of inflation on the benefits paid. Arrangements similar to these are also applied to those entitled to a deferred allowance, so that the deferred allowance increases in the same way as allowances being paid.

Survivors Benefits - Where a Member dies in office or a former Member entitled to an allowance dies, his or her surviving spouse is entitled to an allowance of 60% of the allowance payable to the deceased and for each dependent child this ratio is increased by 10% to a maximum of 40% of the allowance.

III. COMPARISON WITH OTHER JURISDICTIONS

It is common practice in all legislative jurisdictions in Canada to provide for retiring allowances for former members of the legislature and additional allowances for those who have served in salaried offices, for example, the Premier of Prime Minister, Ministers, the Speaker, the Leader of the Opposition. These plans reflect the need to provide adequately for those who have served in elected office, often during their most productive years, usually, as in the cases of most Ministers, at the price of foregoing other career opportunities, and generally, once elected, dependent upon the will of the electorate more than on the individual's decisions for continuance in elected office.

Arrangements do differ somewhat from one legislative jurisdiction to another, most particularly in relation to:

1) the contribution rate of Members - from 6 1/2% in Prince Edward Island to 11% in the case of the Parliament of Canada;

2) the component of remuneration on which the allowance and contributions are based - in the case of the Parliament of Canada and three Legislatures it is the indemnity only, and in the case of eight others, including Nova Scotia, it is the indemnity and general allowance;

3) the age or formula of age plus years of service at which one qualifies for an allowance, having ceased to be a Member - information regarding the requirements of

various provinces and the House of Commons is somewhat inconsistent. Based upon the information published in Canadian Legislatures and informal data from the Nova Scotia Department of Finance, the age or formula of age plus years of service is as follows:

No age requirement

Parliament of Canada

New Brunswick

Years of service plus age

Ontario - years of service plus age equals 55

Newfoundland - years of service plus age equals 60, for Premier 55

British Columbia - years of service plus age equals 60, or upon attaining age 55

Manitoba - years of service plus age equals 55

Quebec - years of service service plus age equals 65 (service after 1/1/88 plus age equals 50)

Age requirement

Prince Edward Island - age 50

Saskatchewan - age 55, option for reduced pension at age 50

Alberta - age 55

Nova Scotia - age 55

4) the annual rate of accumulation of the allowance and the maximum ratio of allowance to remuneration - here a number of other jurisdictions are comparable to Nova

Scotia at a rate of 5% for each year of service for a maximum ratio of 75% of remuneration paid before retirement although a few have a higher maximum ratio; in some provinces the rate of accumulation and the maximum ratio of allowance to remuneration are different.

5) arrangements for a surviving spouse and dependent children - the arrangements in Nova Scotia for payment to a surviving spouse of 60% of the allowance to which a deceased former Member would have been entitled and 10% of the allowance on account of dependent children is generally comparable to the majority of other provinces.

IV. MATTERS REVIEWED

On March 28, 1988, the Minister of Finance for the Government of Canada released draft legislation to implement a new system of tax assistance for retirement saving, including pensions ("proposed tax changes").[3] As of the date of this Report, the proposed tax changes have not been passed by Parliament. The proposed tax changes prescribe strict rules governing registered pension plans. The various requirements are too extensive and elaborate to outline in this Report. However, they will impact upon the plan which is presently registered under the Income Tax Act. This Report takes into account the proposed tax changes in a general way only and consequently their technical impact upon the registered plan under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act will require close scrutiny and monitoring by officials of the Department of Finance, Province of Nova Scotia.

The plan, to which Members contribute under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act and out of which payments are made to former Members, spouses or dependents, is presently registered with Revenue Canada according to officials of the Nova Scotia Department of Finance. As a result of the proposed tax changes, it is possible that the provisions of the Members' Retiring Allowances Act may not be consistent with the future requirements for pension plans registered with Revenue Canada under the Income Tax Act. In order to maintain the retirement allowance under the Act and utilize the intended provisions of the Income Tax Act to the fullest extent permitted, it may be necessary to arrange for future allowance payments to be made from a combination of plans. It is proposed that:

MRA P-1

> Future changes in the requirements for pension plans registered with Revenue Canada be reviewed by officials of the Nova Scotia Department of Finance to enable utilization of the provisions of the Income Tax Act to continue to the fullest extent possible and to provide for utilization of supplemental unregistered pension plans or retirement compensation arrangements or such other administrative measures as may be necessary to enable the provisions for retirement allowances under the Act to continue.

The Commission understands that the Nova Scotia Minister of Finance is considering an actuarial valuation in conjunction with any redesign of the plan which may be necessitated by enactment of the proposed tax changes. Retirement plans for elected governmental officials in Canada are in most instances more generous than standard career pension plans. The retiring allowance is intended to provide some form of financial security for those who serve in elected office. As noted in the accompanying Report on remuneration, elected officials interrupt their private life careers, often at considerable financial sacrifice, to serve as Members of the Legislature. For this reason, the rules for vesting, eligibility, escalation of the deferred allowance and calculation of the allowance payment often vary significantly from standard pension plans. Even though these characteristics of the retiring allowance plan may frustrate any attempt to make the plan actuarially sound, it is important that the cost of the plan be assessed and disclosed from time-to-time, to ensure that the integrity of the plan is maintained.

While the Pension Benefits Act[4] in Nova Scotia provides the pension contributors acquire a vested interest in their plan after two years of membership, the Members' Retiring Allowances Act prescribes

that eligibility for the allowance requires service of at least five years during two or more general assemblies. The conditions for vesting in plans for elected Members vary from province to province, but are generally consistent with those presently in effect under the Act in Nova Scotia, and for that reason, it is not recommended that the vesting provisions be changed at this time.

In earlier reports of the Commission of Inquiry, the possibility of reducing the age of eligibility for an allowance, perhaps by permitting an allowance for former Members whose age and years of service contribution equals 60, was considered. While some have noted the present age of eligibility of 55 is lower than that enjoyed in most corporate and public service pension plans, it is significant to compare that only one other province, namely Alberta, requires a member to attain the age of 55 before receiving the full pension. In one province, as well as the House of Commons, the pension is payable immediately upon ceasing to be a Member. In five provinces, provision is made for payment of the pension under the number of years of service and age equalling a specified number, such as 55 or 60. In two other provinces, provision is made for the pension to be payable at age 50. Thus, while the age of eligibility for an allowance is generous by terms of corporate and public service pension plans, it is modest in Nova Scotia compared with that of other plans for elected officials in Canada. No change is recommended.

It has been submitted that the retiring allowance should be accumulated at the same annual rate as provincial Judges' supplement - the equivalent to seven percent (7%) per annum to a maximum of seventy percent (70%). Presently, entitlement is earned at the rate of five

percent (5%) of the average annual indemnity and expense allowance during the last three years of service to a maximum of seventy-five percent (75%) of the average annual indemnity and expense allowance during the last three years of service. Salaried Members and Minister are entitled to additional allowances accumulating at the rate of five percent (5%) of the average salary payment for the three highest years of salaried service or if a salaried service is less than three years, then the average is that of the actual years served. This appears to be as favourable to Members as the allowance calculation formulae presently in effect in the other provinces as well as the Federal Government and is in excess of what would generally be available through public service or private pension plans. Consequently, no recommendation will be made on this matter.

It has also been submitted that the allowance to be paid should be based upon the present level of remuneration paid to members by way of indemnity and allowance, rather than the level of indemnity and allowance upon which the contributions were made. As indicated, the indemnity and allowance is averaged for the last three years of service and in the event of the salary paid to Ministers and others, it is based upon the average of the highest three years of salaried service. In addition, by regulation under the Act, allowances paid have been increased in recent years by applying the same indexing factor as has been applied to pensions payable under the Public Service Superannuation Act. Thus former Members or their dependents paid an allowance have the benefit of these arrangements to offset, in part at least, the impact of inflation on the benefits paid. Arrangements similar to these are also applied to those entitled to a deferred

allowance, so that the deferred allowance increases in the same way as allowances being paid. It would appear that the retiring allowances for elected Members in other provinces and the Federal Government is based upon a similar foundation of the average of the level of remuneration in the last number of years of service or the average of the highest level of remuneration of service. This means, that generally speaking for retirement schemes for elected representatives, the base is dependent upon the actual level of remuneration which applied at the time that the Member served. The pension base is escalated in Nova Scotia since April 1, 1985, by the increase in Consumer Price Index to a maximum of six percent (6) and although provisions vary from province to province, this is not out of line with the escalation provision applicable elsewhere. In some provinces, there is no automatic indexing of pensions, while in others, the increase based upon C.P.I. is automatic, without any limitation or capping provision. However, it seems to be generally acknowledged that many years ago, elected Members served in the House of Assembly of Nova Scotia at a level of remuneration which, on a comparative basis, was significantly less than the level of remuneration presently offered to those serving in the House of Assembly. Consequently, many former Members, or their spouses or dependents, are now recipients of retiring allowances which may be considered as modest in relation to the financial sacrifice made by the former Members for their years of service to the public. Although this Report has suggested that it may never be possible to expect the plan under this Act to be fully self-funding, nevertheless a major change such as that which has been

submitted could not realistically be considered without a review of its financial impact and cost to the public.

It is proposed that:

MRA P-2

> The Minister of Finance determine the financial impact and cost of any change in the Act which would have the effect of basing the retiring allowance on the present level of annual indemnity and expense allowance either for present Members or for former Members.

Several administrative matters were brought to the attention of the Commission. It was noted that the matter of reciprocity between private or public service pension plans on the one hand, and the retiring allowance under the Act may require review and study. For example, under certain circumstances it may be that an elected Member may be entitled to contribute to the retiring allowance under the Act and at the same time, contribute to another publicly-funded pension plan. Likewise, it was noted that some members, who contribute to the plan under the Act but whose interest does not vest, may lose the opportunity for years of service and contribution to a prior pension plan. The matter of reciprocity between various pension plans and the retiring allowances extends beyond consideration of this Act and may well depend on general government policy with regard to the portability of pension plans in this province. It has also been indicated that the severance allowance payable under the House of Assembly Act and the retiring allowance payable under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act are administered by the Office of the Speaker and the Department of Finance, respectively. It has also been noted that the applicable rate of interest for a refund of contribution under the Act is at four percent (4%) as prescribed by regulation. For the public service, this

rate has been calculated at six percent (6%) and as of January 1, 1989, will be at the rate of ten percent (10%) compounded annually.

Consequently, it is proposed that:

MRA P-3

Selected current administrative practices regarding the plan under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act be considered and reviewed by the Minister of Finance including

(1) reciprocity between the plan under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act and private and other public service plans;

(2) administrative coordination between the payment of severance allowances under the House of Assembly Act and the retiring allowances under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act; and

(3) the applicable rate of interest calculated on the refund of contributions.

In 1980, provision was made by statutory amendment to the Act enabling a Member to elect to count a limited number of years of prior public service in elected municipal office for the purpose of a Member's allowance pursuant to the Act. However, in 1983, this provision was repealed by the House of Assembly. This year, in the course of the Commission's Inquiry, representations were made that the provision should be reinstated. This is a matter which warrants further discussion and future consideration.

V. SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

There are no recommendations for changes in the Members retiring allowance at this time. Improvements in the provisions over the past several years have provided Members and former Members with a plan that is reasonable comparable to those in place for elected officials in other provinces.

Therefore, are no binding recommendations contained in this Report.

VI. SUMMARY OF PROPOSALS

The Commission considers that a number of matters which do not clearly fall within its Commission "to make an Inquiry and a Report respecting the allowances to be paid under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act..." are worthy of further consideration by those responsible for the administration of the Members' Retiring Allowances Act. While these are not recommendations to be implemented by the Speaker, the Commissioner, after inquiry, makes these proposals:

MRA P-1 Future changes in the requirements for pension plans registered with Revenue Canada be reviewed by officials of the Nova Scotia Department of Finance to enable utilization of the provisions of the Income Tax Act to continue to the fullest extent possible and to provide for utilization of supplemental unregistered pension plans or retirement compensation arrangements or such other administrative measures as may be necessary to enable the provisions for retirement allowances under the Act to continue. (p. 10)

MRA P-2 The Minister of Finance determine the financial impact and cost of any change in the Act which would have the effect of basing the retiring allowance on the present level of annual indemnity and expense allowance either for present Members or for former Members. (p. 14)

MRA P-3 Selected current administrative practices regarding the plan under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act be considered and reviewed by the Minister of Finance including

(1) reciprocity between the plan under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act and private and other public service plans;

(2) administrative coordination between the payment of severance allowances under the House of Assembly Act and the retiring allowances under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act; and

(3) the applicable rate of interest calculated on the refund of contributions. (p. 15)

Appendix "A"

FOOTNOTES

1. R.S.N.S. 1967, c. 181, as amended.

2. Canadian Legislatures, 1987/1988, by Robert J. Flemming, Ampersand Communications Services Inc.

3. Draft Amendments to the Income Tax Act Relating to Saving for Retirement, as released by the Honourable Michael Wilson, Minister of Finance, March 28, 1988, with accompanying Department of Finance Release No. 88-32.

4. S.N.S., 1987, c. 11, as amended.

Appendix "B"

The Speaker

House of Assembly
Nova Scotia

PO Box 1617
Halifax, Nova Scotia
B3J 2Y3

902 424-5707

September 7, 1988

Mr. George White, LL.B.
Patterson Kitz
Barristers and Solicitors
P. O. Box 1068
Truro, Nova Scotia
B2N 5B9

Dear Mr. White:

This will confirm your appointment as Commissioner pursuant to Chapter 29 of the Statutes of Nova Scotia, 1983, to make an enquiry and a report respecting the allowances to be paid under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act.

I thank you for your willingness to undertake these duties and can assure you of the full co-operation of the Office of the Speaker in carrying out your work.

I look forward to receiving your report on or before December 1, 1988 as required by the Act.

Yours very truly,

Arthur R. Donahoe
Speaker

ARD:nk